



City of Waukesha
201 Delafield St. Waukesha, WI 53188
Tel: 262.542.3700
waukesha-wi.gov

Committee: Landmarks Commission	Meeting Date: 2023-12-06
Item Number: ID#23-8230	
Subject: Landmarks Commission Certificate of Appropriateness for 408 McCall St. Review a request to replace the roof, gutters, downspouts, garage siding, front porch lattices, and a window (McCall Street Historic District).	

Details:
In July of this year Community Development staff received a complaint about work being done without Landmarks Commission approval at 408-410 McCall St. An inspection determined that at least one window had been replaced and some siding had been removed from a rear addition to the house for replacement. Over the several months after the initial complaint staff mailed four notices of violation to the applicant, along with several citations.

The applicants, Shawn and Todd Brunner, have submitted a Certificate of Appropriateness application for previously completed work, as well as some work that is in progress, or planned for next year. The work includes replacement of at least one window, as well as replacement of the siding for the attached garage, and replacement of the roof.

Already Completed Work: Last year the applicant replaced a picture window on the west side of the house. The applicant has stated that the old window was broken and needed to be replaced immediately. The replacement is two vinyl windows in the opening where one large picture window was previously located. A wood divider has been added between them. The Landmarks Commission's design policies clearly state that replacement windows must match the original in shape and size, and in the arrangement of windowpanes.

Windows are a very important character-defining feature of a historic house. Other homeowners in the McCall Street district, and throughout the City's historic districts, have gone to great efforts to maintain their windows' character, including finding appropriate replacements when necessary. Staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission deny approval of the window and require the applicant to find an appropriate replacement window.

Work Currently Underway: Since July the attached rear garage has had the underlying board walls exposed, with moisture barrier added in stages. The applicant plans to install new siding to the garage. The new siding will be white vinyl, with dimensions to match the existing siding. The garage is attached via a breezeway, but it is in the rear of the house, and it does not contribute to its historic significance. The siding on the main/front section of the house is white aluminum, and is also not original.

Proposed Work: The existing roof has brown 3-tab shingles. The garage roof has been replaced with dimensional shingles which appear to meet the Landmarks Commission's design standards. The applicant would like to replace the main roof on the house with new shingles to match the garage, but has not provided more detail. If the applicant can provide detail, and the shingles do meet the Landmarks Commission's standards, they

can be approved. The rubber flat roof sections will also be replaced. The applicant also plans to replace the gutters and downspouts. The house currently has half-round style gutters.

408 McCall St., the Mary Keene/John and Mary Rodgers house, was built in 1895 and has Queen Anne style architecture. It is considered to be a contributing property toward the character of the McCall Street historic district.

Relevant Secretary of the Interior Standards:

2. The historic character of a property will be retained and preserved. The removal of distinctive materials or alteration of features, spaces, and spatial relationships that characterize a property will be avoided.

5. Distinctive materials, features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property will be preserved.

6. Deteriorated historic features will be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature will match the old in design, color, texture and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features will be substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.

Paint and Repair Grant info:

The 2023 Paint and Repair Grant funds have been fully allocated, and the applicant did not include any estimates in their application, so no Paint and Repair Grant will be reviewed at this time. Work that will be done in 2024 may be eligible for a Paint and Repair Grant if the applicant returns to a future meeting with a cost estimate.

Staff Recommendation:

- Staff recommends approval of the proposed siding replacement and lattice repair provided the new siding is smooth and matches the dimensions of the existing siding, and any new lattices will match the existing ones.
- Staff recommends approval of gutter and downspout replacement with the condition that new gutters will be half-round to match the existing gutters.
- Staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission hold approval of roof replacement until or unless the applicant can provide details of the replacement materials to confirm that they will be consistent with the Landmarks Commission's design policies.
- Staff recommends that the Landmarks Commission deny approval of the window replacement and require the applicant to return with a proposal for a window which will match the dimensions of the original and will be consistent with the Landmarks Commission's design