

**MINUTES**  
**Waukesha Public Library Board**  
**Human Resources Committee Meeting**  
**Wednesday, April 19, 2017 3:00 P.M.**  
**Library Board Room**

**DRAFT**

Trustees Present: J. Fowle, P. Kasprowicz, A. Riebel, M. Ryan, and R. Sura

Trustee Absent:

Others Present: Bridges Library System Director Connie Meyer, Technical Services C. Peil, and Special Projects Coordinator Joan Quinlan

**1. Call to Order**

Committee Chair Riebel convened the meeting at 3:01 p.m.

**2. Approval of the minutes for March 13, 2017 and March 23, 2017**

Trustee Kasprowicz moved to approve the minutes for March 13, 2017 and March 23, 2017. Trustee Ryan seconded, motion carried unanimously.

**3. Discussion/recommendation regarding executive search firm**

The Human Resources Committee reviewed the responses from the request for proposal for executive search firms. The Library received proposals from five firms: Spano Pratt, John Keister, Springsted Waters, Libraries Thrive Consulting, and Bradbury Miller. Firms were ranked by the following criteria: completeness and quality of response to the RFP; ability to meet requested service needs; demonstrated competence and experience in library executive recruitment; expertise and ability of key personnel; total cost to the library; and references and satisfaction of other clients.

Trustee Riebel noted that Spano Pratt, though a local firm, was the highest priced, dealt mainly with non-profits and had no library experience listed. She noted that it was a very thorough and detailed submission. Trustee Kasprowicz agreed and said that he gave the firm the lowest rating due to these factors.

Trustee Riebel said that John Keister specializes in northern Illinois and Wisconsin. Connie Meyer said that Mr. Keister's firm is currently handling the Mequon Public Library Director vacancy. Trustee Sura shared her concern that this firm was involved in hiring the previous Director in Mukwonago, which did not turn out well. Trustee Ryan said that this firm was also involved in hiring the Beloit Public Library Director. Connie Meyer acknowledged that Mr. Keister was involved in the Mukwonago hiring, but noted that their next hire in Beloit has been very successful and she would say the choice was 'brilliant'. Trustee Sura said that she gave them a high score, but said that the proposal was not very thorough. Trustee Kasprowicz gave this firm a ranking somewhere in the middle. The cost was low, but did not include advertising, travel costs, etc. He also had a concern with the Mukwonago situation. He said that he spoke with Mr. Keister and asked for some clarification on his proposal. Trustee Kasprowicz was impressed with his experience. Trustee Sura also had concerns with the advertising costs. Connie Meyer said that there are numerous free avenues for advertising vacant positions; other options do have costs associated with them. This would be an important follow-up question to ask the firms. She added that in today's electronic world, there are many opportunities available for firms to advertise. It is important that they have library connections and networks. Ms. Meyer also said that the firms should use direct recruitment as a tool; approaching library directors at well-run libraries to gauge their

interest. Trustee Ryan liked that fact that John Keister's firm has connections in the area. Trustee Riebel said that the proposal was not as detailed as the others were and wondered how involved they would be in salary negotiations. Trustee Kasprovicz said that the Library Board provides the firm with the salary range before any offer is extended to the candidate.

The proposal from Springsted Waters was very comprehensive and included a recruitment brochure advertising for the Fulton Library System Administrator. Connie Meyer said that Springsted Waters put together a proposal that met many of the requested criteria in the RFP. It was a very thorough document. Trustee Ryan particularly liked the candidate profile and recruitment process. Trustee Kasprovicz said that he contacted one of the references in Racine County and received positive feedback. The timeline is very aggressive. He ranked the firm second, with the cost of \$24,400 bringing the ranking down lower. Connie Meyer mentioned that Washington County has also used Springsted for executive recruitment. The firm does understand government agencies. Trustee Sura said that they would understand policies and procedures. Trustee Riebel said that she also ranked this firm second. She believed that they had a nice balance of government and library recruitment experience. She was concerned that they request 90% of their fee before the interview stage. The firm also included that the Library Board would have access to the master applicant list; not all of the firms did. Trustee Ryan noted that they have a regional office in Milwaukee, but did not mention a local project contact. This firm also has the longest guarantee.

Libraries Thrive Consulting only listed two libraries as previous clients; most of their work has centered on consulting services and not recruiting. Trustee Kasprovicz said that he is not a fan of the hourly rate; there are too many unknowns, which can drive the cost up. It was the consensus of the Committee that this was the least favorite firm in terms of what the Library Board was looking for.

The Library Board was familiar with Bradbury Miller's work. Trustee Riebel said that they have extensive library recruitment experience and work solely with libraries. Trustee Sura noted that they did not include insurance as requested in the RFP. She also said that they searched out previous Director Lynch. Trustee Kasprovicz mentioned that former Director Lynch did not make the initial cut, but at the recommendation of Bradbury, they added him to the final eight interviewees. He believed that Bradbury Miller offered a reasonable timeline. He rated this firm the highest and called several of the references before the meeting. In addition, since the Board's last contact with Bradbury, the firm has merged with Miller Associates, to include two principles, one managing consultant and two associate consultants. Trustee Ryan said that she was impressed that staff all have Library Director experience. Connie Meyer said that she was not as impressed with this proposal; it seemed rather boilerplate and did not include the insurance requirement. She did not rank the firm as high and believed that they could have worked a little harder at putting their proposal together. They definitely have experience and the Library Board knows what they are getting with this firm. She cautioned that they might just look at the people they know who are job seeking and not actively recruit; it would be important to include this in the contract. Trustee Kasprovicz countered that he recalls reviewing at least 30 applicant materials. Bradbury was very active in terms of questions, detailed reference checks, and interviews. Trustee Riebel added that they offered more on site visits. She believed that they presented a reasonable proposal and was impressed with their library connections.

The Committee made the decision to eliminate Spano Pratt based on the prohibitive cost and Libraries Thrive Consulting due to their lack of experience with recruiting. Trustee Kasprovicz said that he ranked John Keister third and thought that the Committee should consider eliminating this firm from consideration as well. Trustee Fowle said that his was a

philosophical decision and that he went back and forth between John Keister and Springsted Waters, but that he would be comfortable either way. Four of the Committee members ranked Bradbury Miller as their number one choice. One Committee member and Connie Meyer ranked Springsted Waters as their first choice. Trustee Sura explained that selecting a firm with government experience would be helpful. The future library director has to be knowledgeable on many issues facing public libraries, including legislative changes, budgets, and fundraising; these are very different strengths and skillsets needed than just for overseeing the library's day-to-day operations. Trustee Riebel said that based on the Committee's review, the top two proposals are Bradbury Miller and Springsted Waters. Trustee Ryan asked if the Library would be responsible for candidate's travel costs to interview. Trustee Kasprovicz said that the Library Board's Human Resources Committee conducted first round Skype interviews the last time. Trustee Ryan thought that Springsted Water's timeline was too aggressive, but Bradbury Miller's timeline is delayed due to current projects they are working on. Trustee Sura noted that she was concerned with giving 90% of the fee to Springsted Waters prior to an accepted offer from a candidate. Trustee Ryan said that Bradbury Miller had specific target dates. Trustee Riebel responded that the hiring process always takes longer than you anticipate, though Bradbury Miller did outline that they expected to have an accepted offer by the end of August with a start date of October. They also have a wider network of clients. Trustee Fowle said that there was not a good reason not to move forward with a firm that the Library Board is familiar with; the bid was reasonable. Trustee Riebel said that Human Resources Committee could address any concerns with Bradbury Miller during contract negotiations. Trustee Kasprovicz added that the Committee should explicitly spell out any concerns in the contract. Connie Meyer remarked that going through the RFP process has helped the Library's Human Resources Committee know exactly what they are looking for in an executive search firm. Trustee Sura said that she still likes Springsted Waters for their standards and excellence and believes that they have other qualifications that they can offer to the process. Connie Meyer agreed that their proposal was well done. Trustee Fowle liked Bradbury Miller, but reserved his right to change his vote at the Library Board meeting. Trustee Kasprovicz encouraged Committee members to contact references. Connie Meyer added that the Library received great responses to their request and that the Committee went through a thoughtful process.

**Trustee Kasprovicz moved to recommend to the Library Board that they accept the Bradbury Miller proposal at a cost not to exceed \$20,000. Trustee Fowle seconded, motion carried with a vote of four to one, with Trustee Sura voting nay.**

#### **4. Adjournment**

Absent any objections, the meeting adjourned at 4:09 p.m.

J. Quinlan, Recorder