



## Project Review Sheet

<b>Committee:</b> Landmarks Commission	<b>Meeting Date:</b> 5/1/2019
<b>Agenda Item Number:</b> 19-0609 and 19-0610	<b>Historic Name/District:</b> McCall St. Historic District
<b>LCOA and LP&amp;RG Request:</b> 233 N. James St.	

**Details:** The applicants, Meghan and Anthony Gorzalski, are seeking a Certificate of Appropriateness and a Paint and Repair Grant for replacement of the roof at 233 N. James St.

The house is currently roofed with red 3-tab shingles, which are at the end of their lifespan and need to be replaced. It also has historic half-round gutters, which the applicant plans to retain. The proposed roof materials are Landmark Pro Maximum Definition shingles which, according to the company's website, are designed to mimic wood shake. The Wisconsin Historical Society's Roof Guidelines for Historic Homes notes that wood shingle roofs were much more common than wood shake, and recommends 3-Tab shingles or architectural shingles with a slight shadow line as a better substitute for wood shingles than dimensional shingles with a more defined shadow line. The applicant is willing to consider alternative materials.

233 N. James St., the Franklin C. Buchan House, was built in 1900 and is an example of Queen Anne style architecture. The applicant believes it was built by Waukesha's first electrician.

**Paint and Repair Grant Information:** Total cost for the roof repair work is \$13,558.32.

**Relevant Secretary of the Interior Standards:**

5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of the deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.

**Staff Recommendation:** Staff recommends approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness for roof replacement at 233 N. James St. with the condition that the new shingles will be 3-Tab style or will have a minimal shadow line.

